

284-SIGNED-ATTACH-A — Executed Stipulation Artifacts: Provenance and Verification Note

Case: Gray v. American Package Co., Inc., Index No. HP 6086/2020 (Civ. Ct. Kings Cty., Housing Part B) **Retrieval date:** September 1, 2026 · **Revised:** September 3, 2026 (v1.1) **Source:** Christian Gray's ProtonMail SENT folder — attachments to the June 19, 2021, 11:24 AM EDT email (archive header 15:24 UTC) from Christian Gray to Margaret Sandercock, Esq. ("Attached are the signed Word doc and PDF. I'm going to be offline until at least the 27th.")

Artifacts

Label	File	MD5	SHA-256
A1	284_ATTACH_A1_Stipulation_Signed_Redline_PDF_20210619.pdf	dcef62ca0ccd613682e02eac7b8980c3	36bca6bc1c1810f6c65f57e8247acae7140e4045b2ae9affcd88ece1fd0bc16a
A2	284_ATTACH_A2_Stipulation_Signed_v2_DOCX_20210619.docx	a6be699bff6585265e4ef8801582b8c2	a0251874a1b96f40ce07d84224751477fa306dbfa9af54364249f222539d41ff

Verified findings

- A1 (signed PDF) is the June 17, 2021 Workshare Compare (redline) document itself, executed.** Extracted text is identical page-for-page (8 of 8 pages) to the redline as transmitted by Goodfarb & Sandercock on June 17, 2021, 4:11 PM (reference copy MD5 db3dce07fa88e1ae615bac3168fb63e). Internal metadata: created Thursday, June 17, 2021, 1:52 PM (Workshare Compare, Belkin Burden Goldman document system, iManage #3078710 v1 → v2, 99 tracked changes); modified Saturday, June 19, 2021, 11:21 AM EDT — the signature application event. The execution copy displays all tracked changes, dual paragraph numbering, and the Workshare comparison-statistics page (page 8). No clean final PDF existed in the signing package.
- A2 (signed Word document) is the clean v2 with a signature image inserted.** Visible text is character-identical (8,123 characters, zero divergence) to the clean v2 as transmitted June 17, 2021 (reference copy MD5 ab7ad213073cb3862381647b1939b4a2). Delta: one PNG signature image (1600 × 1007) plus ordinary resave artifacts. Internal metadata: created and modified Saturday, June 19, 2021, 11:17 AM EDT; Microsoft Word for Mac; revision 2 (opened once, saved once). The lastModifiedBy field reads "Marie Andree"; per Mr. Gray, the signing machine was a hand-me-down MacBook with the prior owner's Microsoft Office registration still installed. The field is a machine-registration attribute, not a witness identification.
- Integrity.** The single-save revision history, the character-identical text, and the four-minute execution window (11:17 AM docx save; 11:21 AM PDF signature) establish that nothing in either instrument was altered at execution beyond the application of Mr. Gray's signature. Chain: received June 17, 4:11 PM → executed June 19, 11:17–11:21 AM → transmitted June 19, 11:24 AM (all EDT).
- Exhibit 1 absent from both executed artifacts.** Each artifact is 8 pages; "Exhibit 1" appears once, as a textual reference in the first paragraph; no scope of work is annexed to either. The scope exhibit — including the eight printed "JG" margin comments appearing on the as-filed Exhibit 1 — was not part of the executed package. Corroborating record: Mr. Gray to Sandercock, August 13, 2021: "I still haven't received Exhibit 1. Can you please have your assistant send it to me."
- Release paragraph numbering — resolved.** On the executed redline the inserted (v2) number at the release paragraph is 10 and the struck (v1) number is 12. Per-character color verification of the June 17 Workshare compare (two independent extraction libraries plus the rasterized pages) shows the shift is fully accounted for within the June 17 round: the "1." on the opening paragraph was struck (the paragraph carries numId=0, numbering removed, in the clean v2 XML) and the v1 ¶10 Emergency Work paragraph was deleted. No intervening version is needed to explain ¶12 → ¶10. The release paragraph text is character-identical (640 characters) across the June 17 redline, the clean v2, A1, and A2.
- No intervening version.** The executed artifacts are byte-consistent with the June 17, 2021, 4:11 PM transmittal package. Time from receipt of the near-final instrument to signature: approximately 43 hours (Jun 17, 4:11 PM → Jun 19, 11:24 AM EDT).
- Drafting origin of the release language.** The landlord's first draft, forwarded to Mr. Gray June 2, 2021, 4:11 PM EDT ("FW: Gray HP," attachment Gray Stipulation of Settlement.pdf, MD5 0777388cb53f1c17b8da703389fd20c9, 11 pages, ScanSnap iX500), already contains the "Petition" definition in its numbered ¶1 and the release at ¶12 with the words "contained in Petition." In the June 17 compare both spans are unmarked (black). Counsel's handwritten notes on the June 2 draft mark ¶1, ¶7, ¶8, ¶10 and ¶13, each of which changed on June 17; ¶12 carries no note. Pages 7–11 of the June 2 PDF are the Olmsted mold-abatement scope with comment balloons JG1–JG8. An earlier working note stating that the Petition definition was inserted on June 17 is withdrawn; it rested on a text extraction that carried no color information.
- As-filed comparison — closed.** NYSCEF Doc 10 (so-ordered June 29, 2021, filed 11:28 AM, MD5 abb5762c, 12 pages, SO-ORDERED signed, APPROVED stamp KI-HOUSING-502 6/29/2021 9:38:04 AM) carries the same release paragraph text as A1/A2 (differences confined to two OCR-layer artifacts) and Exhibit 1 with JG1–JG8 at pages 7–12. The assembled execution scan b958d5f6 (ScanSnap iX1500, created June 20, 2021, 5:59 PM EDT, modified June 21, 11:16 AM EDT; 12 pages; SO-ORDERED line unsigned) sits between A1/A2 and Doc 9/10 in the chain. Exhibit 1 is present in the June 2 draft, absent from the June 17 and June 19 artifacts, and present again from the June 20–21 assembly onward.

Outstanding

None on the executed-artifact chain. Open elsewhere: who assembled Exhibit 1 to the executed instrument between June 19 and June 21, 2021, and from what file, is not established by any artifact in hand.

END — 284-SIGNED-ATTACH-A Provenance and Verification Note v1.1